Rubrics: What are they? Why Use them?

Faculty Senate Assessment Committee

Facilitator: Katherine Cermak
Assistant Dean for Planning & Assessment

April 2013

Outcomes

- Participants will be able to:
  - Understand what rubrics are and ways they can be useful
  - Identify different types of rubrics and their components
  - Draft rubrics
  - Locate resources to revise, create, and evaluate rubrics

What is a rubric?

- A rubric is a scoring tool that:
  - describes the specific expectations for a task, activity, or product;
  - identifies the relevant criteria; and
  - provides a short description of what is expected at different levels of achievement,

Why use rubrics?

- For faculty:
  - Increases Consistency
  - Reducing Grading Time
  - Providing Feedback
- For students:
  - Clarifying Expectations/Reducing Complaints
  - Allowing for Self-Assessment/Monitoring Development

Vocabulary

- Types of Scoring Tools
  - Holistic Rubrics
    - Single score
  - Analytic Rubrics
    - Scores can be parsed

Rubric Components

- Task Description (Assignment and/or Outcome)

- Criteria (Dimensions or Tasks)

- Scale (Levels of Achievement or Competency)

- Performance Descriptors (Qualifying Statements)

Example: Analytic Rubric

{ Poster Presentation:
Effectively present information through visual media.

SCALE LEVELS

CRITERIA

	NEEDS IMPROVEMENT	DEVELOPING	MEETS EXPECTATIONS	EXCEEDS EXPECTATIONS
Coverage of topic	The details on the poster do not provide sufficient information about the topic and may be unrelated.	The poster provides detail, but it is either insufficient or includes minutia.	The poster includes details but may have some missing information or may provide unnecessary information.	Poster is sufficiently detailed to provide necessary information about the topic while not being crowded or densely packed.
Use of graphics	It is unclear how the graphics support the topic.	Graphics relate to the topic, but connections are not explicit.	Graphics are related to the topic and make it easier to understand.	Graphics grab attention, are relevant to the topic, and increase audience understanding.
Organization	Information is not clearly organized.	Information is not organized with titles and subheadings.	Information is organized titles, subheadings, and fonts.	Information is clearly organized with appropriate use of title, headings, and fonts.
Grammar, Punctuation, and Mechanics	There are major, persistent errors in grammar, punctuation, or mechanics. Typos are found throughout the poster.	There are recurrent errors in grammar, punctuation, or mechanics. Typos are prominent.	There are minor, occasional errors in grammar, punctuation, or mechanics. There may be a few inconspicuous typos.	The poster is free or nearly free of errors in grammar and punctuation. There are no typos.

DESCRIPTORS

Example: Holistic Rubric

TASK DESCRIPTION { Poster Presentation:
Effectively present information using visual media.

LEVELS CRITERIA DESCRIPTORS

Exceeds Expectations: Poster is sufficiently detailed to provide necessary information about the topic while not being crowded or densely packed. Graphics grab attention, are relevant to the topic, and increase audience understanding. Information is clearly organized with appropriate use of title, headings, and fonts. The poster is free or nearly free of errors in grammar and punctuation. There are no typos.

Meets Expectations: The poster includes details but may have some missing information or may provide unnecessary information. Graphics are related to the topic and make it easier to understand. Information is organized titles, subheadings, and fonts. There are minor, occasional errors in grammar, punctuation, or mechanics. There may be a few inconspicuous typos.

Developing: The poster provides detail, but it is either insufficient or includes minutia. Graphics relate to the topic, but connections are not explicit. Information is not organized with titles and subheadings. There are recurrent errors in grammar, punctuation, or mechanics. Typos are prominent.

Needs Improvement: The details on the poster do not provide sufficient information about the topic and my be unrelated It is unclear how the graphics support the topic. Information is not clearly organized. There are major, persistent errors in grammar, punctuation, and mechanics. Typos are found throughout the poster.

Example: Analytic Rubric

Poster Presentation:
Effectively present information through visual media.

	NEEDS IMPROVEMENT (2)	DEVELOPING (3)	MEETS EXPECTATIONS (4)	EXCEEDS EXPECTATIONS (5)
Coverage of topic (x4)	The details on the poster do not provide sufficient information about the topic and may be unrelated.	The poster provides detail, but it is either insufficient or includes minutia.	The poster includes details but may have some missing information or may provide unnecessary information.	Poster is sufficiently detailed to provide necessary information about the topic while not being crowded or densely packed.
Use of graphics (x3) (No graphics will results in zero points)	It is unclear how the graphics support the topic.	Graphics relate to the topic, but connections are not explicit.	Graphics are related to the topic and make it easier to understand.	Graphics grab attention, are relevant to the topic, and increase audience understanding.
Organization (x2)	Information is not clearly organized.	Information is not organized with titles and subheadings.	Information is organized titles, subheadings, and fonts.	Information is clearly organized with appropriate use of title, headings, and fonts.
Grammar, Punctuation, and Mechanics (x1)	There are major, persistent errors in grammar, punctuation, or mechanics. Typos are found throughout the poster.	There are recurrent errors in grammar, punctuation, or mechanics. Typos are prominent.	There are minor, occasional errors in grammar, punctuation, or mechanics. There may be a few inconspicuous typos.	The poster is free or nearly free of errors in grammar and punctuation. There are no typos.

50 total points. A= 44 – 50, B = 38 – 43, C = 32 – 37, D= 26 – 32.

Analytic or Holistic?

Analytic

- Uses
  - As a teaching tool about the nature of high quality work
  - For students to self assess
  - To weight criteria to identify relative importance
  - For identifying strengths and weaknesses at the student and program level
- Limitations
  - Takes longer to make
  - Slower to use
  - Poorly descriptors can reduce consistency

Holistic

- Use
  - To quickly determine overall performance
  - When speed is important
  - When simpler products are being assessed
- Limitations
  - Can be less precise—different work can receive the same score for different reasons
  - Not very useful for identifying strengths and weaknesses

Activity: Dining Out Rubric

- Reflect on the criterion of a good dining experience (and a poor experience).
- List criterion.
- Determine highest and lowest levels.
  - How many total levels are there?
- Think of brief descriptors for each level.

Rubric on Rubrics

	Unacceptable 1	Acceptable 2	Good 3	Exemplary 4
Clarity of criteria	Criteria being assessed are unclear, inappropriate and/or have significant overlap	Criteria being assessed can be identified, but are not clearly differentiated or are inappropriate	Criteria being assessed are clear, appropriate and distinct	Each criteria is distinct, clearly delineated and fully appropriate for the assignment/ outcomes
Distinction between Levels	Little/no distinction can be made between levels of achievement	Some distinction between levels is evident, but remain unclear	Distinction between levels is apparent	Each level is distinct and progresses in a clear and logical order
Reliability of Scoring	Cross-scoring among faculty and/or students often results in significant differences	Cross-scoring by faculty and/or students occasionally produces inconsistent results	There is general agreement between different scorers when using the rubric	Cross-scoring of assignments using rubric results in consistent agreement among scorers

Resources

- Katherine Cermak, Assistant Dean for Planning & Assessment
  - X3-1579 or cermak@usna.edu
- Rae Jean Goodman, Director of Faculty and Learning
  - X3-2506 or goodman@usna.edu

- Additional Training
  - Explanations/instructions/resources:
    - http://manoa.hawaii.edu/assessment/howto/rubrics.htm
    - http://jfmueller.faculty.noctrl.edu/toolbox/rubrics.htm
  - Tutorial/Module
    - http://www.ucdenver.edu/faculty_staff/faculty/center-for-faculty-development/Documents/Tutorials/Rubrics/index.htm

Resources

- Rubric Banks
  - Association for the Assessment of Learning in Higher Education
    - http://course1.winona.edu/shatfield/air/rubrics.htm
      - 200+ Categorized Rubrics for Humanities, Math, Science, Engineering, Critical and Creative Thinking, Ethics, etc.
  - University of Hawaii—Manoa
    - http://manoa.hawaii.edu/assessment/resources/rubricbank.htm
      - General education skills.
  - American Association of Colleges and Universities
    - http://www.aacu.org/value/rubrics
      - Valid Assessment of Learning in Undergraduate Education
- Reading
  - *Learner-Centered Assessment on College Campuses* by Mary E. Huba and Jann E. Freed. Allyn and Bacon, 2000.
  - *Introduction to Rubrics,* by Dannelle D. Stevens and Antonia J. Levi. Stylus Publications, 2005.

Your Turn

- Consider the assignment you've brought with you.
  - What should students demonstrate on the assignment?
    - What are the most important things? What counts?
  - Describe a high performing and a low performing example.
    - (If the assignment has been given before look at actual examples.)
- Consider how you will use the rubric.
  - As a teaching tool?
  - To provide feedback? Strengths and weaknesses?
  - How complex does it need to be to do the job?
- Decide on a holistic or analytic rubric.
  - Determine criteria, scale and descriptors.
- Share/Get feedback/Test/Refine

Parting Advice

Share with colleagues

Pilot whenever possible
(use old assignments)

Rubrics are written on paper not in stone.

Back-up Slides

Example: Checklist

(Used when indicating the presence or absence of a trait.)

Laboratory Safety Checklist			
	Y	N	N/A
Follow all written and verbal instructions carefully.			
Perform only authorized and approved experiments, and only in the presence of an instructor.			
Never eat, drink, chew gum, or taste anything in the laboratory.			
Keep hands away from face, eyes, and mouth while using science materials or when working with chemicals.			
Wash your hands with soap and water before leaving the laboratory.			
Never remove safety glasses or goggles during an experiment.			
Clean all work areas and equipment at the end of the experiment.			
Report all accidents (fire, spill, breakage, etc.), injuries (cut, burn, etc.), or hazardous conditions (broken equipment, etc.) to the instructor immediately.			
Do not touch or smell any chemicals unless specifically instructed to do so.			

When to use rubrics?

Constructed Response

- Capstone Projects
- Demonstrations and Performances
- Diagrams or Models
- Essays and Research Papers
- Oral Exams and Poster Presentations
- Products

Selected Response

- Multiple Choice or True/False
- Listing
- Matching
- Short Answer/Phrase